

CENTRE FOR SCIENCE AND ENVIRONMENT

MAIN OFFICE: 41, Tughlakabad Institutional Area, New Delhi-110 062 INDIA
 Tel: 2995 5124, 2995 6110, 2995 6394, 2995 6399 **Fax:** 91-11-2995 5879 **Email:** cse@cseindia.org **Website:** www.cseindia.org
BRANCH OFFICE: Core 6A, Fourth Floor, India Habitat Centre, Lodhi Road, New Delhi-110 003
Tel: 2464 5334, 2464 5335



June 4, 2013

LEAVES
OF
IMPORTANT
SURVIVAL
TREES
IN
INDIA --
MAHUA,
KHEJDI,
ALDER,
PALMYRA
AND
OAK

Mr. Rohan Vaziralli
 Country Manager (India)
 ELCA Cosmetics Pvt. Ltd.
 #302, 3rd Floor, Nirman Kendra
 Dr. E. Moses Road, Famous studio lane
 Mahalaxmi, Mumbai – 400011

Subject: Presence of Heavy Metals in Cosmetic Products of ELCA Cosmetics Pvt. Ltd.

Dear Mr. Vaziralli,

Centre for Science and Environment (CSE) has been working on toxins and their health impacts since early 1990s. CSE's Pollution Monitoring Laboratory (PML) has taken proactive position by consistently researching on this issue and informing public, regulators and industry about it.

PML recently tested various cosmetic products available in Indian market for presence of heavy metals. We tested several brands of lipstick, lip-balm, anti-ageing cream, fairness cream for heavy metals such as mercury, lead, cadmium, chromium and nickel.

Our results show presence of chromium and nickel in the lipsticks of ELCA Cosmetics Pvt Ltd. as follows:

- Estee Lauder (Scarlet Siren - 73) contained 1.34 ppm of chromium and 2.36 ppm of nickel.
- Estee Lauder (Fuchsia Fever - 60) contained 0.99 ppm of nickel.
- MAC (Paramount - A52) contained 1.14 ppm of chromium and 2.19 ppm of nickel.
- MAC (Plumful - A62) contained 1.22 ppm of chromium.
- MAC (Cockney - A82) contained 2.32 ppm of chromium.
- MAC (So Chaud - A82) contained 5.75 ppm of chromium and 3.42 ppm of nickel.

The presence of these metals in lipsticks is a serious public health issue, as these are used by a large number of women across the country. Most of the users are unaware of the presence of heavy metals in these products and the potential health hazards of their long term continuous exposure.

Chromium is known to cause lung cancer in its hexavalent form. It may also damage the small capillaries in kidneys and intestines. Nickel is known to cause cancer at high exposure levels. Allergy to nickel is also common and it can cause severe contact dermatitis. These health hazards are not exhaustive. In the wake of our findings, we would like to know your response on the following:

- Why chromium and nickel are present in the products of ELCA Cosmetics Pvt. Ltd.? What is the rationale of allowing/adding them?
- Do you monitor the presence of heavy metals such as chromium and nickel? What have you done so far to minimise their presence? What are the plans (if any) for phasing out these metals from your product?
- Are there any efforts/initiatives to make the consumer aware about the presence of such heavy metals and their potential ill effects?
- If this brand is sold in other countries; is it exported from India or manufactured in the respective country? What is the level of chromium and nickel found in this brand sold in other countries?
- Do you make this on your own or outsource its manufacturing? Who is the manufacturer and from where it is imported if not manufactured in India?

Founder Director
ANIL AGARWAL

EXECUTIVE BOARD

Chairperson
M.S. SWAMINATHAN

Director General
SUNITA NARAIN

Deputy Director General
CHANDRA BHUSHAN

Members
A.K. SHIVA KUMAR
B.D. DIKSHIT
B.G. VERGESE
G.N. GUPTA
N.C. SAXENA
VIRENDRA KUMAR
WILLIAM BISSELL

ELCA Cosmetics Private Limited
 12A-05, G-Block, 13th Floor
 Parinee Crescenzo, Behind MCA
 Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051
 Tel: +91 22 6147 9800
 Fax: +91 22 6147 9898

ESTÉE
 LAUDER
 COMPANIES

June 28, 2013

To: Center for Science and Environment
 41, Tughlakabad Institutional Area,
 New Delhi 110 062
 Attn: Mr. Chandra Bushan (Deputy Director General)

From: ELCA Cosmetics Private Limited

Ref: Your letter dated June 4th, 2013
 Subject: Presence of Heavy Metals.

Dear Sir,

Please find below our statement from the Estee Lauder Companies:

FROM THE ESTÉE LAUDER COMPANIES UNAVOIDABLE TRACE STATEMENT:

At The Estée Lauder Companies, consumer safety is a top priority. We work continuously to meet, if not exceed, the standards put forth by global governmental, regulatory, and scientific bodies, as well as our own exceedingly high quality assurance standards.

That is why we want to clearly address any concerns regarding the ingredients used in our formulations. Let us assure you that we do not formulate with any heavy metals, including chromium and nickel. However, some ingredients, such as those that come from the Earth, may contain small amounts of natural elements. This should not be cause for concern.

Unavoidable traces of Earth elements are everywhere. They are in the air we breathe and the food we eat. For instance, you can find them in vegetables, such as potatoes, onions, beets, and broccoli; in meats and seafood, even those that are labeled organic. With modern analytical techniques, even the most miniscule amount of these Earth elements may be detected in cosmetic products. Again, this is not a concern. Governmental authorities in the United States, Asia, and the European Union agree that there is no safety or health risk associated with the presence of trace amounts of such naturally occurring elements in cosmetic products that meet established regulatory standards.

The Estée Lauder Companies stands behind the safety of the products we produce and sell globally.

Thanking you,

Rohan Vaziralli

Authorized Signatory & Country Manager

